
Daily sitting 23

Thursday, May 9, 2019

1 o'clock p.m.

Prayers.

Mr. Landry welcomed to the House Mr. Donald Arseneault, former Liberal MLA for Dalhousie-Restigouche East (2003-2014), and Campbellton-Dalhousie (2014-2017).

Hon. Mr. Carr welcomed to the House Mr. Max White, former Confederation of Regions MLA for Sunbury (1991-1995).

Mr. Savoie, Government House Leader, announced that it was the intention of government that Bill 14 be called for second reading; following which, Opposition Members' Business would be considered.

The following Bill was read a second time:

Bill 14, *An Act to Amend the Motor Vehicle Act.*

Ordered referred to the Committee of the Whole House.

At 2.02 p.m. the House recessed. At 2.30 p.m. the House resumed.

Pursuant to Notice of Motion 39, Mr. C. Chiasson moved, seconded by Ms. Thériault:

WHEREAS in 2012, the Report of the Second Language Task Force recommended that the entry point for French immersion be Grade 1;

WHEREAS leading expert literature on the subject suggests that children are more likely to be successful in learning a second language when it is introduced to them at a younger age;

WHEREAS in 2017, the previous government introduced the Grade 1 entry point for French immersion;

WHEREAS in December 2018, the Minister of Education and Early Childhood Development indicated the government was considering revisiting the Grade 1 entry point for French immersion;

WHEREAS the Minister cited concerns about the Grade 2 provincial reading assessment scores as supporting a decision to move the entry point to a later year;

WHEREAS there is no evidentiary basis to support the Minister's claims that reading assessments were related to early French immersion;

WHEREAS the Minister then tried to justify his musings on moving the Grade 1 entry point with claims that there is a shortage of French immersion teachers;

WHEREAS the Minister launched an online public opinion survey on the issue that was widely criticized for being biased and containing leading questions to support the Minister's position;

WHEREAS public consultation on this important issue has been woefully inadequate;

WHEREAS instead of trying to manage issues of teacher resources and implementation, the Minister maintains the position that the only solution is to change the entry point;

WHEREAS teachers, parents and many others have expressed concerns about creating instability in the educational system if significant changes are made to the French immersion program;

WHEREAS there has been insufficient time to adequately measure the success of the program;

BE IT THEREFORE RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly urge the government to not move forward with changes to the entry point for immersion.

And the question being put, a debate ensued.

And after some time, Hon. Mr. Gauvin, seconded by Hon. Ms. Anderson-Mason, moved in amendment:

AMENDMENT

That Motion 39 be amended:

By deleting the resolution clause and replacing it with the following:

“BE IT THEREFORE RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly urge the government that any decision on the entry point of French immersion be made within the context of a broader discussion on second language programming in the province.”

Mr. Speaker put the question on the proposed amendment and a debate ensued.

At 4 p.m. the House recessed. At 4.14 p.m. the House resumed.

And after some time, Mr. Arseneau, seconded by Ms. Mitton, moved a sub-amendment:

SUB-AMENDMENT

That the amendment to Motion 39 be amended:

By deleting “that any decision on the entry point of French immersion be made within the context of” and replacing it with “to maintain the entry point of French immersion no later than Grade 1 and engage in”.

Mr. Speaker put the question on the proposed sub-amendment and a debate ensued.

At 4.46 p.m. the House recessed. At 4.52 p.m. the House resumed.

And the debate being ended, and the question being put on the sub-amendment, it was defeated on the following recorded division:

YEAS - 23

Mr. Arseneault	Ms. Mitton	Mr. Gallant
Mr. Melanson	Mr. Bourque	Mr. LeBlanc
Mr. Landry	Ms. Landry	Mr. K. Chiasson
Ms. Rogers	Ms. Thériault	Mr. Horsman
Mr. Harvey	Mr. LePage	Mr. Lowe
Ms. Harris	Mr. C. Chiasson	Mr. McKee
Mr. Kenny	Ms. LeBlanc	Mr. D'Amours
Mr. Coon	Mr. Arseneau	

NAYS - 24

Hon. Mr. Holder	Hon. Mr. Flemming	Hon. Mr. Carr
Mr. Savoie	Hon. Ms. Anderson-Mason	Hon. Mr. Holland
Hon. Mr. Higgs	Hon. Mr. Gauvin	Hon. Mr. Urquhart
Hon. Mr. Steeves	Hon. Mr. Stewart	Hon. Mr. Oliver
Hon. Ms. Shephard	Hon. Mr. Cardy	Mr. Northrup
Mr. Austin	Mr. DeSaulniers	Mr. Fitch
Ms. Conroy	Hon. Mr. Wetmore	Mr. Fairgrieve
Hon. Ms. S. Wilson	Hon. Ms. M. Wilson	Mr. Crossman

Mr. Speaker put the question on the amendment and it was adopted.

Mr. Speaker put the question on Motion 39 as amended as follows:

WHEREAS in 2012, the Report of the Second Language Task Force recommended that the entry point for French immersion be Grade 1;

WHEREAS leading expert literature on the subject suggests that children are more likely to be successful in learning a second language when it is introduced to them at a younger age;

WHEREAS in 2017, the previous government introduced the Grade 1 entry point for French immersion;

WHEREAS in December 2018, the Minister of Education and Early Childhood Development indicated the government was considering revisiting the Grade 1 entry point for French immersion;

WHEREAS the Minister cited concerns about the Grade 2 provincial reading assessment scores as supporting a decision to move the entry point to a later year;

WHEREAS there is no evidentiary basis to support the Minister's claims that reading assessments were related to early French immersion;

WHEREAS the Minister then tried to justify his musings on moving the Grade 1 entry point with claims that there is a shortage of French immersion teachers;

WHEREAS the Minister launched an online public opinion survey on the issue that was widely criticized for being biased and containing leading questions to support the Minister's position;

WHEREAS public consultation on this important issue has been woefully inadequate;

WHEREAS instead of trying to manage issues of teacher resources and implementation, the Minister maintains the position that the only solution is to change the entry point;

WHEREAS teachers, parents and many others have expressed concerns about creating instability in the educational system if significant changes are made to the French immersion program;

WHEREAS there has been insufficient time to adequately measure the success of the program;

BE IT THEREFORE RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly urge the government that any decision on the entry point of French immersion be made within the context of a broader discussion on second language programming in the province.

And the question being put, Motion 39 as amended was resolved in the affirmative on the following recorded division after leave was granted to dispense with the ten-minute time allotted for the ringing of the bells:

YEAS - 24

Hon. Mr. Holder	Hon. Mr. Flemming	Hon. Mr. Carr
Mr. Savoie	Hon. Ms. Anderson-Mason	Hon. Mr. Holland
Hon. Mr. Higgs	Hon. Mr. Gauvin	Hon. Mr. Urquhart
Hon. Mr. Steeves	Hon. Mr. Stewart	Hon. Mr. Oliver
Hon. Ms. Shephard	Hon. Mr. Cardy	Mr. Northrup
Mr. Austin	Mr. DeSaulniers	Mr. Fitch
Ms. Conroy	Hon. Mr. Wetmore	Mr. Fairgrieve
Hon. Ms. S. Wilson	Hon. Ms. M. Wilson	Mr. Crossman

NAYS - 23

Mr. Arseneault	Ms. Mitton	Mr. Gallant
Mr. Melanson	Mr. Bourque	Mr. LeBlanc
Mr. Landry	Ms. Landry	Mr. K. Chiasson
Ms. Rogers	Ms. Thériault	Mr. Horsman
Mr. Harvey	Mr. LePage	Mr. Lowe
Ms. Harris	Mr. C. Chiasson	Mr. McKee
Mr. Kenny	Ms. LeBlanc	Mr. D'Amours
Mr. Coon	Mr. Arseneau	

The Order being read for second reading of Bill 23, *An Act to Amend the Electricity Act*, a debate arose thereon.

And after some time, Mr. Speaker interrupted proceedings and announced that the hour of daily adjournment had arrived.

And then, 6 o'clock p.m., the House adjourned.

The following document, having been deposited with the Clerk of the House, was deemed laid upon the table of the House pursuant to Standing Rule 39:

Documents requested in Notice of Motion 42

May 8, 2019